



Minutes

Of the Shire of Cranbrook

Audit Committee

Held on Wednesday 17 July 2019

At 12:30pm in the Cranbrook Council Chambers

DISCLAIMER

This agenda has yet to be dealt with by the Council. The recommendations shown at the foot of each item have yet to be considered by the Council and are not to be interpreted as being the position of the Council. The minutes of the meeting held to discuss this agenda should be read to ascertain the decision of the Council.

In certain circumstances members of the public are not entitled to inspect material, which in the opinion of the Chief Executive Officer is confidential, and relates to a meeting or a part of a meeting that is likely to be closed to members of the public.

No responsibility whatsoever is implied or accepted by the Shire of Cranbrook for any act, omission, statement or intimation occurring during Council or Committee meetings.

The Shire of Cranbrook disclaims any liability for any loss whatsoever and howsoever caused arising out of reliance by any person or legal entity on any such act, omission or statement of intimation occurring during Council or Committee meetings.

Any person or legal entity who acts or fails to act in reliance upon any statement, act or omission made in a Council or Committee meeting does so at that person's or legal entity's own risk.

In particular and without derogating in any way from the broad disclaimer above, in any discussion regarding any planning application or application for a licence, any statement or intimation of approval made by any member or Officer of the Shire of Cranbrook during the course of any meeting is not intended to be and is not taken as notice of approval from the Shire of Cranbrook.

The Shire of Cranbrook advises that anyone who has any application lodged with the Shire of Cranbrook must obtain and should only rely on WRITTEN CONFIRMATION of the outcome of the application and any conditions attaching to the decision made by the Shire of Cranbrook in respect of the application.

The Shire of Cranbrook advises that any plans or documents contained within this agenda may be subject to copyright law provisions (Copyright Act 1968, as amended) and that the express permission of the copyright owner(s) should be sought prior to their reproduction. It should be noted that Copyright owners are entitled to take legal action against any persons who infringe their copyright. A reproduction of material that is protected by copyright may represent a copyright infringement.

CONTENTS

- 1. DECLARATION OF OPENING / ANNOUNCEMENT OF VISITORS**
- 2. RECORD OF ATTENDANCE / APOLOGIES / LEAVE OF ABSENCE (PREVIOUSLY APPROVED)**
- 3. PUBLIC QUESTION TIME**
 - 3.1 RESPONSE TO PREVIOUS PUBLIC QUESTIONS TAKEN ON NOTICE
 - 3.2 PUBLIC QUESTION TIME
- 4. DISCLOSURE OF INTEREST**
- 5. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETINGS**
 - 5.1 MINUTES OF AUDIT COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 20 MARCH 2019
- 6. GENERAL BUSINESS**
 - 6.1 AUDIT 30 JUNE 2018 – SIGNIFICANT MATTER RAISED
- 7. CLOSURE OF MEETING**

MINUTES

1. DECLARATION OF OPENING / ANNOUNCEMENT OF VISITORS

The Chairperson, Cr Adams declared the meeting open at 12.31pm

2. RECORDS OF ATTENDANCE / APOLOGIES / LEAVE OF ABSENCE (PREVIOUSLY APPROVED)

ATTENDANCE

Chairperson	Cr DJ (David) Adams
Councillors	Cr CY (Colin) Egerton-Warburton Cr PL (Phil) Horrocks Cr PM (Peter) Beech Cr P (Peter) Denton Cr DS (David) Carey Cr VN (Vanessa) Fiegert

Chief Executive Officer	Mr PB (Peter) Northover
Manager of Finance & Administration	Mrs PA (Trish) Standish
Manager of Works	Mr JE (Jeff) Alderton
Works Supervisor	Mr WM (Wayne) Toovey

Members of the Public	Nil
-----------------------	-----

LEAVE OF ABSENCE

Councillors	Cr ER (Ruth) Bigwood Cr PW (Peter) Slater
-------------	--

APOLOGIES	Nil
-----------	-----

3. RESPONSE TO PREVIOUS PUBLIC QUESTIONS TAKEN ON NOTICE

Nil

4. PUBLIC QUESTION TIME

(Rules of Public Question Time circulated to members of public)

Nil

5. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING

5.1 Audit Committee Meeting – 20 February 2019

Moved Cr Denton, seconded Cr Horrocks that the minutes from the Shire of Cranbrook Audit Committee meeting held on 20 March 2019, be confirmed as a true and correct record.

Carried 7/0

6. GENERAL BUSINESS

6.1	AUDIT – SIGNIFICANT MATTER RAISED
RESPONSIBLE OFFICER:	Trish Standish – Manager of Finance and Administration
REPORT AUTHOR:	Trish Standish – Manager of Finance and Administration
FILE REFERENCE:	FM 9
APPLICANT:	N/A
DATE OF REPORT:	1 July 2019
ATTACHMENTS:	Nil

Purpose

The purpose of this report is to provide the Audit Committee with a report addressing a matter identified as 'significant' in the 2017/2018 Audit Report, pursuant to section 7.12A of the Local Government Act 1995.

Background

Council adopted the Annual Financial Statements and the Office of the Auditor General (OAG) independent audit report for the year ending 30 June 2018 on 20 March 2019. Section 7.12A (4) (a) of the Local Government Act 1995 dictates the submission of a report to the Minister regarding the significant adverse trend noted by the OAG in their independent auditor's report.

The OAG identified the Operating Surplus Ratio that has been below the Department of Local Government, Port and Cultural Industries (DLGSCI) standard for the past three years as a significant adverse trend.

Officers Comment

The operating surplus ratio is a measure of the Shire's ability to cover its operational costs and have revenues available for capital funding or other non-operating purposes. The calculation method is:

$$\frac{\text{operating revenue minus operating expenses}}{\text{own source operating revenue}}$$

A basic standard is met between 0.01 and 0.15. An advanced standard is met if the ratio is greater than 0.15. Over the past eight years the Shire's operating surplus ratio has been as follows:

2018	(0.52)
2017	(0.27)
2016	(0.73)
2015	0.08
2014	(0.24)
2013	(0.26)
2012	0.70
2011	0.62

Council will recall that Mr Paul Gilbert from Macleods Corporation Pty Ltd addressed this issue as part of his report after undertaking the Financial Management Review in January 2019.

The report states:

“Financial Ratios

Council’s financial ratio performance generally exceeds the Local Government Departments expectations, we consider that the Shire has healthy financial operating ratios. Only the Operating Surplus Ratio and the Asset Sustainability Ratio do not meet with expectations and this is consistent with many other regional Councils illustrating an economic dependency on grants.

Both ratios are adversely impacted by the high level of non-cash depreciation expense, particularly as it relates to roads and bridges causing an operating deficit (despite an operating cash-flow surplus). We recommend that depreciation rates be reviewed.”

This ratio is the most difficult to address, as it requires Council to ensure that its revenue sources grow at the same or a greater rate than its operating expenses, including depreciation. The introduction of fair value of all assets resulted in Council increasing the value of its assets which has caused a negative flow on effect to the amount of depreciation booked due to the increase in carrying values of assets.

It is well known that regional Councils struggle to fully cash fund asset depreciation as their revenue sources are limited. The only major source of funding that Council can control is rates. The challenge that faces Council is in order to achieve an operating surplus ratio result that is within the benchmarks established by the DLGSCI is striking a balance between how much of a rate burden should be placed on ratepayers and how much of a reduction in service levels should occur to contain rising operating expenses.

Whilst depreciation rates have been reviewed, it is quite possible that this ratio will remain at a level below the DLGSCI standard due to cost pressures and limited revenue sources.

Statutory Environment

The Local Government Act 1995 Section 7.12A states that:

“(4) The Local Government must:

- (a) prepare a report addressing any matters identified as significant by the auditor in the audit report and stating what action the local government has taken or intends to take with respect to each of those matters; and
 - (b) give a copy of that report to the Minister within 3 months after the audit report is received by the local government.
- (5) Within 14 days after a local government gives a report to the Minister under subsection (4)(b), the CEO must publish a copy of the report on the local government’s official website.”

Policy Applicable – Implications

There is no Council policy applicable to this report.

Financial Implications

There are no financial implications from this report.

Risk Implications

The risks associated with matters in this report are:

- Errors, Omissions and Delays
- Failure to fulfil Statutory, Regulatory or Compliance Requirements

The **impact** of the risk is Non-Compliance

The **consequences** of these risks are considered to be Insignificant

The **likelihood** is Possible

Hence the **risk rating** is Low

Risk mitigation includes reporting to Council and the Department of Local Government Sport and Cultural Industries.

Strategic Community Plan Reference

The 2017-2027 Shire of Cranbrook, Strategic Community Plan states that:

Objective 4: Leadership - Demonstrate strong governance, leadership and organisational growth

Outcome 4.1: Excellence in governance, compliance, regulation and reporting

Strategy 4.1.1: Maintain a high level of corporate governance, responsibility and accountability

Consultation

Consultation was not required for this report.

VROC Implications

There are no strategic VROC implications from this report

Voting Requirements

Simple Majority

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION

Moved Cr Beech, seconded Cr Horrocks that the Audit Committee recommends to the Council that this attached report be accepted and forwarded to the Minister.

Carried 7/0

7. CLOSURE OF MEETING

There being no further business to discuss the Chairperson, Cr Adams declared the meeting closed at 12.44pm.