

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

<b>SUBMISSION – K Morrell</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>Having recently heard that a Shire home in Mason St has recently been valued at \$135,000 deems houses in Cranbrook, valuation is now extremely low.</p>	<p>The property has been valued by an independent licensed valuer who provides valuation, advisory and specialist property services throughout Albany and the Great Southern area of WA.</p> <p>The valuation of the property takes into account that the roof requires replacing and this has an indicative replacement cost of \$50,000.</p> <p>The valuation states both the internal and external condition of the residence to be in 'Fair' condition and the valuation reflects the current state of the residence in its entirety.</p> <p>The report also states that given the requirement that the roof is in need of replacement this would have an adverse effect on the selling period which may be longer than expected. Any intending purchaser is highly likely to discount the value of the dwelling by the cost of repairs. The period of time and the inconvenience of having to replace the roof will also have a negative effect on the value and marketability of the dwelling and its current value. These factors have been taken into account when assessing the property's value.</p>
<p>I would expect having a Shire house valued by only one person, it appears the Shire is perceiving all other homes to be greatly devalued.</p>	<p>Section 3.58 of the Local Government Act 1995 states that the local government must advertise the market value of the disposition - as ascertained by a valuation carried out not more than 6 months before the proposed disposition. The property has been valued by an independent licensed property valuer on 21 April 2021. There is no legislative requirement for a second value to be obtained.</p> <p>The Shire do not undertake property valuations, hence why an independent licensed valuer was contracted. The Shire would encourage ratepayers to have their own independent valuations conducted to ascertain the value of their properties if they choose to do so.</p>

## SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

<p>I would think the Shire will now see that all homes in Cranbrook, see a definitive change in Shire rates. Starting this financial year. If not it appears all rate payers are being dealt a low blow from Shire personnel.</p>	<p>Property rates in the Cranbrook townsite are rated at the Gross Rental Value (GRV) not Market Value of the property as deemed by the Valuer General, not the Shire. The Shire do not set the value of the property to calculate property rates. The Council set the rate in the dollar only, which is multiplied by the GRV to ascertain the amount of rates to be charged. If ratepayers do not agree with the GRV of their property they are encouraged to contact the Valuer General and submit a formal request for a re-valuation.</p> <p>Shire staff have acted in accordance with legislation and have provided all relevant information in order for the Council to make the most informed decision possible.</p>
---	--

<b>SUBMISSION – G Kleemann, G Sayers</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>I would like to question the valuation of \$135,000 that you obtained for the house on lot 258 Mason St Cranbrook that you intend to sell to Damond and Natasha Briggs.</p>	<p>The property has been valued by an independent licensed valuer who provides valuation, advisory and specialist property services throughout Albany and the Great Southern area of WA.</p> <p>The valuation of the property takes into account that the roof requires replacing and this has an indicative replacement cost of \$50,000.</p> <p>The valuation states both the internal and external condition of the residence to be in 'Fair' condition and the valuation reflects the current state of the residence in its entirety.</p> <p>The report also states that given the requirement that the roof is in need of replacement this would have an adverse effect on the selling period which may be longer than expected. Any intending purchaser is highly likely to discount the value of the dwelling by the cost of repairs. The period of time and the inconvenience of having to replace the roof will also have a negative effect on the value and marketability of the dwelling and its current value. These factors have been taken into account when assessing the property's value.</p>

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

<p>It is a double brick, tiled roof house with four bedrooms, two bathrooms, a large living area, carport with established yard and fence.</p>	<p>The house is a 154m<sup>2</sup> double brick, tiled roof (which requires replacement) house with four bedrooms, <u>one</u> bathroom, a reasonable sized living area and carport on a 1234m<sup>2</sup> block.</p>
<p>Similar vacant blocks are available in the area for \$35,000 and so brings the estimate for this house back to \$100,000.</p>	<p>Research on <a href="http://www.realestate.com">www.realestate.com</a> shows that vacant blocks are available in Cranbrook townsite for \$25,000 (see attached Development WA flyer) and have been for sale on the open market for a considerable amount of time and have not been sold, therefore cannot be used as market evidence.</p> <p>Council will recall discussion with Development WA at the March Council briefing session in relation to the high value of these blocks and the fact they had not sold at this price.</p>
<p>To build a transportable home in Cranbrook to just lock-up stage costs approximately \$130,000 so how can you value this beautiful brick home which was originally build for our CEO for only \$135,000 not forgetting necessary fees for transfer.</p>	<p>The cost to build a transportable home in Cranbrook is anecdotal, the Shire have not sought quotes so are unable to comment. The Shire did not value this property. It is however, quite often found that the purchase of a 45 year old house will be a cheaper option than building a new house and is seen to be more affordable for young families trying to get into the housing market. Many young families will be eligible for the first home owners grant meaning they will not be required to pay stamp duty on the purchase of an existing home.</p>
<p>This proposition totally de-values any house sale in the town, now and for future valuations especially when the three most recently sold fibro houses realised an average of \$200,000 and they were only three bedroom one bathroom much older homes.</p>	<p>The property has been valued by an independent valuer who provides valuation, advisory and specialist property services throughout Albany and the Great Southern area of WA. The valuation of the property takes into account that the property is in 'fair' condition and requires replacement of the roof, which has an indicative replacement cost of \$50,000. If this is taken into consideration, the valuation is \$185,000.</p> <p>The Market Evidence in Cranbrook used for the valuation report comprised:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A 1624m<sup>2</sup> block with a 4 bed, 2 bath renovated 176m<sup>2</sup> fibro home. This was considered to be superior accommodation, a larger dwelling,</li> </ul>

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

	<p>superior added value of ancillary improvements that included a 40sqm deck, garage and a rear patio that sold in 2019 for \$200,000.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A 1746m<sup>2</sup> block with a 3 bed, 1 bath neat but dated 161m<sup>2</sup> home. This was considered to be a larger dwelling, similar quality with superior car accommodation that sold in 2020 for \$100,000.</li> </ul> <p>Other market evidence used included Tambellup properties that were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A 2023m<sup>2</sup> block with a 4 bed, 1 bath brick &amp; tile 207m<sup>2</sup> residence with a free standing garage. This was considered to be a superior dwelling quality that sold for \$160,000 in 2020.</li> <li>• A 2429m<sup>2</sup> block with a 3 bed, 2 bath brick &amp; tile 175m<sup>2</sup> residence. This was considered to be similar quality although a larger dwelling, that sold for \$170,000 in 2019.</li> </ul> <p>The Shire would encourage ratepayers to have their own independent valuations conducted to ascertain the value of their properties if they choose to do so.</p>
<p>Council has a small unit with a Strata Title for sale in the same area for \$180,000?</p>	<p>Unit 8A Currie Street was first listed for sale in 2016 via public auction and then placed on the open market. Council have not received any offers to purchase this ten-year-old unit and the listing has now expired. It is noted that the property is still listed on the internet, however there is no current listing agreement in place for this property.</p>

<p><b>SUBMISSION – I &amp; D Kleemann, M &amp; R Moncrieff, R &amp; M Lawson, Michael ?, C &amp; C Maybury</b></p>	<p><b>RESPONSE</b></p>
<p>We would like to question the valuation of \$135,000 that you obtained for the house on lot 258 Mason St Cranbrook that you intend to sell to Damond and Natasha Briggs.</p>	<p>The property has been valued by an independent licensed valuer who provides valuation, advisory and specialist property services throughout Albany and the Great Southern area of WA.</p> <p>The valuation of the property takes into account that the roof requires replacing and this has an indicative replacement cost of \$50,000.</p>

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

	<p>The valuation states both the internal and external condition of the residence to be in 'Fair' condition and the valuation reflects the current state of the residence in its entirety.</p> <p>The report also states that given the requirement that the roof is in need of replacement this would have an adverse effect on the selling period which may be longer than expected. Any intending purchaser is highly likely to discount the value of the dwelling by the cost of repairs. The period of time and the inconvenience of having to replace the roof will also have a negative effect on the value and marketability of the dwelling and its current value. These factors have been taken into account when assessing the property's value.</p>
<p>We are referring to a solid double brick, tiled roof house built in the 1980's for our CEO of the day with four large bedrooms, two bathrooms, large living area, carport, established yard with fence in a prime location with similar vacant blocks in the same area valued at \$35,000.</p>	<p>The house is a 154m<sup>2</sup> double brick, tiled roof (which requires replacement) house with four bedrooms, <u>one</u> bathroom, a reasonable sized living area and carport on a 1234m<sup>2</sup> block, located on Mason Street in Cranbrook.</p> <p>Research on <a href="http://www.realestate.com">www.realestate.com</a> shows that vacant blocks are available in Cranbrook townsite for \$25,000 (see attached Development WA flyer) and have been for sale on the open market for a considerable amount of time and have not been sold, therefore cannot be used as market evidence.</p> <p>Council will recall discussion with Development WA at the March Council briefing session in relation to the high value of these blocks and the fact they had not sold at this price.</p>
<p>This estimation sets a precedence and devalues every home owner's house in the town for today and for future valuations, especially when three recently sold houses realised an average of \$200,000 and they were only three bedroom, one bathroom, much older fibro homes.</p>	<p>The property has been valued by an independent valuer who provides valuation, advisory and specialist property services throughout Albany and the Great Southern area of WA. The valuation of the property takes into account that the property is in 'fair' condition and requires replacement of the roof, which has an indicative replacement cost of \$50,000. If this is taken</p>

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

	<p>into consideration, the valuation is \$185,000.</p> <p>The Market Evidence in Cranbrook used for the valuation report comprised:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A 1624m2 block with a 4 bed, 2 bath renovated 176m2 fibro home. This was considered to be superior accommodation, a larger dwelling, superior added value of ancillary improvements that included a 40sqm deck, garage and a rear patio that sold in 2019 for \$200,000.</li> <li>• A 1746m2 block with a 3 bed, 1 bath neat but dated 161m2 home. This was considered to be a larger dwelling, similar quality with superior car accommodation that sold in 2020 for \$100,000.</li> </ul> <p>Other market evidence used included Tambellup properties that were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A 2023m2 block with a 4 bed, 1 bath brick &amp; tile 207m2 residence with a free standing garage. This was considered to be a superior dwelling quality that sold for \$160,000 in 2020.</li> <li>• A 2429m2 block with a 3 bed, 2 bath brick &amp; tile 175m2 residence. This was considered to be similar quality although a larger dwelling, that sold for \$170,000 in 2019.</li> </ul> <p>The Shire would encourage ratepayers to have their own independent valuations conducted to ascertain the value of their properties if they choose to do so.</p>
<p>To build a transportable fibro, three bedroom house just to a bare 'lock up stage' is an estimated \$130,000 and this does not include the block price, foundations, all second fixing, established yard, fence etc.</p>	<p>The cost to build a transportable home in Cranbrook is anecdotal, the Shire have not sought quotes so are unable to comment. It is quite often found that the purchase of a 45 year old house will be a cheaper option than building a new house and is seen to be more affordable for young families trying to get into the housing market.</p>
<p>Surely ratepayers would expect Council to obtain the best price for a building of this nature and why was it not put out for general tender to gain the better price and only advertised in a paper which does not encourage many sales?</p>	<p>Section 3.58 of the Local Government Act 1995 defines the process required for the disposal of local government property. Shire staff have acted in accordance with legislation.</p>

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

	<p>A private offer to purchase the property was received from the tenant of the property. For the Council to begin to consider disposal, a valuation must be obtained. This has occurred and the offer to purchase together with the valuation was submitted to Council for consideration at the May 2021 Council meeting as a confidential report. The resolution from this meeting was:  <i>“That the Chief Executive Officer be authorised to advertise the sale of Lot 258 Mason Street, Cranbrook for public comment in accordance with section 3.58(2) of the Local Government Act 1995 to Damond and Natasha Briggs, for the sum of \$135,000.”</i></p> <p>This procedure is in accordance with Section 3.58(3)(a) which states the local government must give <u>local</u> public notice of the proposed disposition. Local public notice is defined as a newspaper circulating in the district.</p>
<p>A small unit built with Strata title, within two hundred meters from this location for sale at \$180,000 by the Shire, makes one question the valuation and we feel, that as ratepayers, if it is entirely necessary to sell this house then a second realistic valuation should be obtained.</p>	<p>Unit 8A Currie Street was first listed for sale in 2016 via public auction and then placed on the open market. Council have not received any offers to purchase this ten-year-old unit and the listing has now expired. It is noted that the property is still listed on the internet, however there is no current listing agreement in place for this property.</p> <p>The Council may wish to pay for a second valuation from another independent property valuer, however there is no legislative requirement to do so.</p>
<p>To drop the standards of a town does not give anybody an incentive to own a home in Cranbrook and is it not Councils policy to own homes to guarantee workers and encourage them to live in the town?</p>	<p>Affordable housing was a key focus area that gained significant comments from the community during the community consultation process that was undertaken earlier this year for the preparation of the Community Strategic Plan that was adopted by Council on 19 May 2021. Council have also discussed on numerous occasions, various options of making residential land available within the Cranbrook townsite for as little as \$1 (if possible) to encourage families to purchase land and live in the town.</p>

## SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

	<p>It is Council policy that tenants of any Shire property be given the opportunity to purchase at the assessed market valuation provided that they have kept the property in good condition throughout their tenancy, have made all rental payments and have held a tenancy for 12 months or more.</p> <p>The sale of this property to Mr Briggs and his family will offer them the security of owning their own home, investing in their future in Cranbrook as well as assist the Council with funds to build a new residence, thus giving the town an uplifting welcoming appearance to new-comers.</p> <p>Shire staff have acted in accordance with legislation and have provided all relevant information in order for the Council to make the most informed decision possible.</p>
--	---

<b>SUBMISSION – G &amp; M Denney</b>	<b>RESPONSE</b>
<p>It is with great dismay as a ratepayer we observed an advert in the Albany Advertiser on 25.5.21 stating intent to sell the above house and block being 4 bedrooms , double brick and tile on a town block for an absurdly low price.</p>	<p>The property has been valued by an independent valuer who provides valuation, advisory and specialist property services throughout Albany and the Great Southern area of WA. The valuation of the property takes into account that the property is in 'fair' condition and requires replacement of the roof, which has an indicative replacement cost of \$50,000. If this is taken into consideration, the valuation is \$185,000.</p> <p>The Market Evidence in Cranbrook used for the valuation report comprised:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A 1624m<sup>2</sup> block with a 4 bed, 2 bath renovated 176m<sup>2</sup> fibro home. This was considered to be superior accommodation, a larger dwelling, superior added value of ancillary improvements that included a 40sqm deck, garage and a rear patio that sold in 2019 for \$200,000.</li> <li>• A 1746m<sup>2</sup> block with a 3 bed, 1 bath neat but dated 161m<sup>2</sup> home. This was considered to be a larger dwelling, similar quality with superior car accommodation that sold in 2020 for \$100,000.</li> </ul>



SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

	<p>Other market evidence used included Tambellup properties that were:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A 2023m<sup>2</sup> block with a 4 bed, 1 bath brick &amp; tile 207m<sup>2</sup> residence with a free standing garage. This was considered to be a superior dwelling quality that sold for \$160,000 in 2020.</li> <li>• A 2429m<sup>2</sup> block with a 3 bed, 2 bath brick &amp; tile 175m<sup>2</sup> residence. This was considered to be similar quality although a larger dwelling, that sold for \$170,000 in 2019.</li> </ul>
<p>As custodians of the ratepayers property we think your duty of care would be to obtain the highest possible price not the lowest. A second valuation may have been a good start.</p>	<p>Section 3.58 of the Local Government Act 1995 defines the process required for the disposal of local government property. Shire staff have acted in accordance with legislation.</p> <p>A private offer to purchase the property was received from the tenant of the property. For the Council to begin to consider disposal, a valuation must be obtained. This has occurred and the offer to purchase together with the valuation was submitted to Council for consideration at the May 2021 Council meeting as a confidential report. The resolution from this meeting was:</p> <p><i>“That the Chief Executive Officer be authorised to advertise the sale of Lot 258 Mason Street, Cranbrook for public comment in accordance with section 3.58(2) of the Local Government Act 1995 to Damond and Natasha Briggs, for the sum of \$135,000.”</i></p> <p>This procedure is in accordance with Section 3.58(3)(a) which states the local government must give <u>local</u> public notice of the proposed disposition. Local public notice is defined as a newspaper circulating in the district.</p> <p>The Council may wish to pay for a second valuation from another independent property valuer, however there is no legislative requirement to do so.</p>
<p>If this sale goes ahead those of us ratepayers who decided to purchase property in the town will have the value of their house decreased considerably because of the Shire and Councillors poor fiscal decision.</p>	<p>The Shire would encourage ratepayers to have their own independent valuations conducted to ascertain the value of their properties if they choose to do so.</p>

SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED

	<p>Shire staff have acted in accordance with legislation and have provided all relevant information in order for the Council to make the most informed decision possible.</p>
<p>Can the shire afford the significant reduction in rate revenue because of this.</p>	<p>Property rates in the Cranbrook townsite are rated at the Gross Rental Value (GRV) not Market Value of the property as deemed by the Valuer General, not the Shire. The Shire do not set the value of the property to calculate property rates. The Council set the rate in the dollar only, which is multiplied by the GRV to ascertain the amount of rates to be charged. If ratepayers do not agree with the GRV of their property they are encouraged to contact the Valuer General and submit a formal request for a re-valuation.</p>
<p>We hope this matter will be reconsidered until a realistic valuation and sale price is obtained.</p>	<p>This matter has been advertised in accordance with Section 3.58 (3)(a) of the Local Government Act 1995. The matter is now being referred back to the Council in accordance with Section 3.58 (3)(b) of the Local Government Act 1995.</p>